



Notes: New Modules and Other Additions to NCS

By Dr. Mason Gaffney

Article citation:

Gaffney, Mason. "Notes: New Modules and Other Additions to NCS." No date. Notes.

Fair Use Disclaimer

The Robert Schalkenbach Foundation, a non profit private foundation, is publishing this article, at no cost, pursuant to the Fair Use provisions of Section 107 of the Copyright Act which states that under certain circumstances, the fair use of a copyrighted material for purposes of criticism, comment, teaching, scholarship and research is not an infringement of copyright. If you have any concerns about the publication of this article, please contact us at info@schalkenbach.org.

The Robert Schalkenbach Foundation's Digital Collections and Archives is an extension of the Robert Schalkenbach Foundation's Engel Georgist Library. It collects, organizes, preserves, and provides free online access to researchers and the general public of Georgist literature including books, newspapers, pamphlets, scholarly articles and archival materials.

RSF is particularly proud to offer free online access to the works of the late Georgist scholar Mason Gaffney, made possible through the generosity of the Danica Foundation and with the consent of the Mason and Letitia Gaffney Trust.

Robert Schalkenbach Foundation: <https://schalkenbach.org/>

Engel Georgist Library: <https://www.librarycat.org/lib/EngelGeorgistLibrary>

RSF Digital Collections and Archives: <https://schalkenbach.starter1ua.preservica.com/>

New Modules and Other Additions to NCS

New Chapters

1. Racism as a weapon vs. H.G.

Prof. Dunning, who formulated the standard racist critique and characterization of Radical Republican Reconstructionism, in History Dept. at Columbia, at time of Seth Low, J.B. Clark, Abram Hewitt, E.R.A. Seligman, etc. Hewitt must have loved it.

Racist strategy against use of the property tax in s.e. states, immanent on the prose of popular historian Claude Bowers.

Emma Lazarus and H.G.

Now that racism is viewed askance, new accusations used vs. H.G. - that he was a racist himself (anti-Chinese).

2. George and feminism.

HG an early feminist, like J.S. Mill (only less extreme). Contrast with extreme male chauvinism of idols of NCE, Edgeworth and Pareto, and Nicholas M. Butler, and probably some others.

(It's still true that economics is the ONLY field in which no female has ever been awarded a Nobel laureate.)

Cynical view of marriage by Chicago economists - just another market, ruled by supply and demand. Libertarians like Harry Browne and Ayn Rand voice overtly what is just implicit and subliminal in NCE: marriage should be a short term revocable contract.

Carrie Chapman Catt, link between feminists and Georgists. Catt was a member of the Fels Fund Commission, 1915-, and therefore clearly committed to the single tax. Newton Baker tried to place Catt on the proposed Single Tax ticket, 1920 (this is a hard one to nail down; other prospects were Brand Whitlock, who declined, and Wm. Gorgas the sanitary engineer).

Catt is best known for leading the fight that won the 19th Amendment - votes for women, 1920. She also founded the League of Women Voters, a powerful idealistic organization that has long supported public schools, opposed child labor, opposed corruption and graft, and shown sympathy with Georgists. She was active opposing child labor, and supporting public schools. In the spate of current lit. on female history, I should find something. Jane Addams was friendly, as was Lilian Wold.)

Struggle against child labor, a defining issue, and a link between Georgists and Feminists. (Feminists who opposed child labor were characterized as Reds and Lesbians - a view endorsed in 1999 by the von Mises Inst.)

Feminist economists and historians now so active and productive are silent on these important matters. Academic feminism has been captured and diverted into other avenues, many of them trivial. One wonders: how did this happen?

3. The single tax as a major political threat,

A. Present material is now divided into two parts, introduced incidentally. Will pull this together as a chapter, and add new material.

B. The threat is exemplified by Tom Johnson.

Leading role of Tom Johnson in politics of Ohio, the mother of post-bellum presidents. Obsession of Mark Hanna, McKinley's manager, and various dirty pols he kept, on blocking Johnson (who kept Hanna, a national kingmaker, from controlling his own city). "Ripper Bills" used in Ohio State Capitol to weaken local land tax movements in Cleveland and Toledo, especially. Francis Russell's definitive bio of Warren Harding, a surprise source on Johnson, and all of Ohio politics.

Some confirmation from Robert Bremner, who wrote a series for the AJES and Will Lissner on Ohio cities - but is deadly dull.

Otherwise, harken to the "silence of the lambs" (historians and economists). Even Arthur Nichols Young's History of the Single Tax Movement (written under the supervision of Frank A. Fetter) omits Ohio politics, mentions Johnson only in passing. Plays up odd uprisings in small towns.

The political sociology of suppression: social pressures used to ostracize Johnson, described by Frederic Howe. Lincoln Steffens, the city muckraker, finds only one U.S. mayor to praise: Johnson. Johnson's hiring of Wm. Bemis, an academic fired for wrong thinking.

Johnson and urbanism. Johnson understood and implemented one vital function to make it work: cheap mass transit, rates set at "marginal cost," fixed costs covered by land taxation. (Link with George and urbanism, below.)

Subsequent "discovery" of Johnson's pricing principle by ahistorical NCE-ists, notably Hotelling, with no credit to Johnson, not even from Vickrey. Mischaracterization of Hotelling by Arrow.

C. Hidden histories of local single-tax campaigns, found buried in state and regional Historical Reviews. Articles on Missouri, California, Maryland, already in hand. Look for material on the upper midwest, especially: The Non-Partisan League, the Farmer-Labor Party, LaFollette's party in Wisconsin, Milwaukee under Mayor Hoan, etc. Every state has its Historical Review, or nearly so. Hoan wrote a book.

D. Influence of H.G. followers, including H.G., Jr., on bending the twig of the Federal income tax when it was new. Progressive subversion of the tax since then, one detail at a time, to its present awful form, endorsed by NCE-ists. (Done.)

E. New York:

-Manhattan Single Tax Club, with exemption of new housing, 1923-33 or so, with help of Al Smith, a Presidential candidate.

- Career of H.G. Jr., Congressman from Brooklyn

F. Major effort, led by N.M. Butler, to capture Republican Party and beat back the Progressives - leading to Warren Harding, 1920. Use of Columbia and Northwestern Universities as power base for conservative wing of the Republican Party. Progressive Republicans had been infected with the single tax virus, conservationism, the Pinchot bros., George Record, et al. Roles of candidates Hiram Johnson, tamer of the S.P.R.R. in California, and Bob LaFollette, who beat back the r.r.s in Wisconsin.

G. LVT in western Canada. Spate of Canadian lit. demeaning LVT in Western Canada. Its academic sources. (Done.)

H. Georgist elements in Mexican Revolution. Active suppression by U.S. government, even Woodrow Wilson. Roles of Albert Fall, W.R. Hearst.

I. Jose Marti and H.G. Marti was a journalist in NY, supported H.G., later carried his ideas to Cuba and points south. (More info needed.)

4. Chapter on Logos Abused (done).

5. The French connection.

A. Gradual, cautious discreditation of the Physiocrats by mischaracterization, trivialization, and ridicule - a precedent for the treatment of H.G. Seligman's use of Voltaire's travesty. Most NCEists dismiss Physiocrats by alluding in passing to their errors and crudities, so they may ignore their strong points. Here, as later with H.G., the strategy is not to refute Physiocracy, but to silence it, get it out of the public dialogue and off the agenda.

Contrast trivialization by critics (quote them) with the actual power and threat of Physiocrats. Quesnay's central place in The Enlightenment, the Age of Reason, the Encyclopedists, etc. His influence on Joseph II of Austria, Holy Roman Emperor, patron of Mozart; Joseph's early death, 1780. Turgot's brief ascendancy in Versailles, and sacking by Queen Marie Antoinette, 1776. French Revolution as poetic justice, and confirmation and vindication of the Physiocrats.

Their influence on Franklin, Jefferson and Adams, American envoys in France; and Tom Paine. Burke vs. Paine on the French Revolution. Hamilton promotes U.S. war against France, fails. Francophiles take over U.S. with Jefferson, 1801. U.S. Whigs (name taken by the post-Hamiltonians) and their court historians campaign against The Terror for the next 100 years or more, liken Reconstruction to it. Promotion of works of Burke;

of Crane Brinton at Harvard; of Claude Bowers; etc. Tract by President White of Cornell attacking currency errors of the French Revolution.

Physiocrats' influence on Adam Smith, hard for English writers to ignore. Cooptation of Smith by the Manchester School, taking laissez faire from the Physiocrats, suppressing other ideas. (Research needed into the Manchester School.)

B. Walras's later writings on land taxation, "the co-proprietorship of land by the state," and their sequestration by the translator, Wm. Jaffe of Northwestern Univ. Resulting distorted view of Walras in Anglophone literature. Walras's exile from France. His denunciation of how Bastiat and other French economists with secure chairs twisted the words and belittled the contributions of the Physiocrats. (Half done.)

6. The power of egalitarian land movements in the U.S. before George, and the Whiggish efforts to bend minds against them:

a. Common lands and their importance in original colonies, from 17th Century; their gradual piecemeal enclosure took over 300 years.

b. Egalitarian 50-acre "headrights" in early VA, precursor of Homestead Act.

c. Equal land shares in 17th Century New England. Squatters' Rights in early NH, supersede baronial claims of the Mason family, lead to rapid settlement of NH while better lands in lower, fertile valleys were held as wildernesses.

d. Reliance of early colonies on land taxation. Hamilton's assumption of their war debts; his use of excise taxes. Robert Livingston's propaganda to substitute income tax for property tax in New York.

e. Confiscation and distribution of Tory estates, 1776-89 - the international comity of property was too weak to evict the new settlers, although Hamilton tried.

f. Debt repudiations, same era.

g. Jefferson's Northwest Ordinance, 1787, institutional basis for the subdivision of Ohio into small farms.

h. Jeffersonian credit sales of land, 1800-20, planting small farms in Ohio and the rest of the old N.W. Territory.

i. Anti-rent movement, Hudson Valley, melding into Free Soil Movement and birth of the Republican Party. Roles of Seward, Clinton, Greeley, G.H. Evans, and other national leaders who rose from this movement. Possible link with Fenian Raids on Ontario, patronized by some powerful but shadowy figures, probably Radical Republican congressmen, aborted by President Andrew Johnson, probably as part of his struggle with Congress.

j. Public schools movement in the north, financed by local property taxes.

k. Egalitarian land and water distribution among Mormons, replicating 17th Century New England in 19th Century Utah, Idaho, Arizona.

Parallel movements among Hispanic colonizers (echoed in The Milagro Beanfield War); also among other utopian and ethnic colonists.

Federalist egalitarianism of Major John Wesley Powell, Elwood Mead.

Local Mutual Water Companies (a Canadian import), and Irrigation Districts (contemporary with H.G.).

l. Vital role of Emancipation in de-sanctifying, demystifying property - a central theme of Mark Twain (a San Francisco journalist contemporary with H.G. Irony of their founding the Bohemian Club, now a bastion of establishmentarian reaction).

m. Radical Republicans and Abolitionists, 1861-77; effects in the old Confederacy. (Violent, militant reaction of southern chauvinism and racism obscured and denied the good that was done, aborted and reversed some of it.)

n. Material from Sapiro lawsuit on history of Calif. State Board of Equalization, created to prevent underassessment of land. (Stan wrote up 30-40 pages on this, as part of a lawsuit; gave it to me to use as I please.)

o. Open access to fisheries, many areas, clear up to the present.

p. Open access to public highways, following tollroad era. (NCEists are now striving to privatize highways again.)

7. George and Religion

A. New Chapter on Fr. McGlynn, Leo XIII, and H.G. (Done. Deals with response of Catholic economic doctrines, expounded in Encyclicals, to Georgism.)

B. Anti-biblical bias of universities, threw out the baby (Leviticus) with the bathwater (orgiastic individual salvation, anti-intellectualism, Calvinistic elitism, etc.).

C. Complex relationship with Zionism (Lazarus, Fels, Weisman, Mosaic land law in Israel, etc.) Hofstadter's baseless innuendo.

D. George's overt religiosity - unique among economists.

E. George as exemplar of the social gospel. Use of orgiastic religion and individualized salvation (monadism) to undercut and subvert social gospel, Moses, the Prophets, and Jesus.

8. George and Evolution.

His kinship with A.R. Wallace and teleology, coupled with cautious attitude towards Darwin, hostility with Huxley and

Spencer. Universities bend more toward random Darwinian evolution. Marxists produce their own form of social teleology, captivating most intellectuals.

Alfred Russel Wallace, Land Nationalization, cooperation with H.G. Denigration of Wallace by academics, and their apotheosis of Darwin, the elitist who toyed with Malthus and Eugenics (Galton, his cousin). (Done.)

(Incidental modern echoes. Diane Paul, "The 9 Lives of Discredited Data," on phony twin studies; new book on *The Bell Curve*, reviving a fallacy that every economist used to recognize as such, since wealth distributions bear no resemblance to the bell curve).

9. The economy of abundance (based on paper given at Melbourne)

10. Popular culture and literature and theatre, its political role.

J.F. Cooper, Wm. Cullen Bryant, et al., for the big landlords; Tom Paine for the median persons. Popularity of Dickens in America; Shelley, Byron, Browning, vs. the complacency of Wordsworth; Tennyson lends respectability and cachet to social reform. Later, Hamlin Garland, Shore Acres, Wm. Dean Howells, Mark Twain, Brand Whitlock, et al. for H.G. Baden-Powell, Dan Beard, and the Boy Scout movement.

With growth of cinema, suppression of the free cinema, from 1920, exemplified by fate of H.G.'s son-in-law, Wm. de Mille, producer of radical films. (See Steven J. Ross, 1998, *Working Class Hollywood*.) Roles of Federal police agencies, Catholic Church, bankers and chains of distributors (major urban landowners). Subliminal survivals of fragments of radicalism in the horse opera, submerged by the focus on atavistic code duello of southern plantations. Abortive revival of old land reform themes during W.W. II, in Dragonwyck by Anya Seton. (Then came Jos. McCarthy, the Hollywood Ten, and all that.)

11. New chapter, on Abram S. Hewitt (a major player in Am. History, major iron producer, among the richest men in America, who led forces opposing egalitarian reconstruction in the south, before he took on H.G., and funded the Am. Ec. Assn.).

Link with chapter on R.T. Ely.

Material on Post and Leubuscher on campaign of 1886; Hewitt's avowal that his motive in running was solely to block H.G.

Material on Hewitt's wealth, merger with Carnegie Steel, relations with Peter Cooper.

Material from Gustavus Myers, History of Tammany Hall.

Material from Vann Woodward, bio. by Allan Nevins, Eric Foner, Paul Buck, and other writers on Reconstruction.

12. Political power and the Administration of Columbia University. (To follow and be linked with the chapters on J.B. Clark and E.R.A. Seligman, which are already too long by themselves, especially the one on Clark.)

A. More on Seth Low, from Robert Fitch. Low was the son of an opium dealer. Low, a Brooklyn pol and real estate man, moved Columbia uptown, buying land in advance. As Mayor, took lead in cutting welfare pmts.

B. Much more on Nicholas Murray Butler, President of Columbia, major manipulator of Republican politics at convention of 1920. It was mainly Butler who placed Warren Harding in White House, largely to block the path of Progressives, esp. Hiram Johnson, but also Leonard Wood. The trick was to block Wood without tipping votes to Johnson. Harding, a known mediocrity, was the desperate answer.

(A bit of titillating scandal, too: Nan Britton, Harding's young paramour who got pregnant, got hired at both Butler's Columbia and Ely's Northwestern to keep her quiet. Imagine the uproar if Bill Clinton did that! "See 'im in the House of Commons, passin' lawrs to stamp out croime; W'ile th' garrrl as 'e 'as rooinned, slinks awigh to 'ide 'er shoime)

Butler was not just a colorful college president, but a major national political figure and kingmaker. (Was awarded Nobel Peace Prize, 1933; ironically, in company with Jane Addams, a George sympathizer. Butler figured prominently among those who favored child labor; Addams, like Louis Post, led the fight against it.)

12. Influence of H.G. on historiography:

1. Our Land and Land Policy, 1871. George's debt to Sen. George Julian of Indiana, a promoter of The Homestead Act. Tributes by noted hisorian Paul Gates. Wide adoption of H.G.'s (somewhat exaggerated) map showing extent of r.r. land grants. General failure to credit H.G.; extinction of his name.

2. George as originator of what came to be called "The Turner Thesis" - w/o credit to H.G. Subsequent misrepresentation and trashing of Turner thesis by urbanists - again w/o credit to H.G., the urbanist. (Confusion over the term "agrarian," used by many as epithet for communist or leveller.)

3. H.G.'s cyclical theory of historical cycles, preceded Spengler and Toynbee.

13. Influence of H.G. on Conservation Movement, thus indirectly on modern environmentalist movement.

A. Georgist Progressive fellow-travellers included The Conservationists, like Pinchot, Garfield, et al. The key question was one of entitlements to land: who may we presume owns it? The Conservationists said, we all do. Quotes from Gifford Pinchot; more from Amos, his brother (and note the significance of the name, Amos, the land reformer).

Georgists in the early Conservation Movement. Echoes of H.G. in oratory of T.R. T.R.'s cabinet, with Pinchot and James Garfield, Jr. (the latter a contact of Tom Johnson). Concept of reserving vast lands for the people, as nat. parks, nat. forests, and grazing lands. Albert Fall, early privatizer, falls into Teapot Dome scandal. Reaction to the scandal aborts privatization during the rest of the Republican Ascendancy.

John Wesley Powell, Elwood Mead - applying conservation ethic to western waters, and fostering Irrigation Districts. Peculiar egalitarian institutions of the irrigation frontier, the new one discovered during the George-influenced Progressive Era. Rapid reversal of those institutions, and concentration of irrigated landownership, and corresponding control of limited water sources, during the NCE era. (Irrigated land is now much more concentrated than other farmland; and the scarce water sources go with the land.)

B. Coase, Stigler, and apologists for polluters put down George, and Georgist ideas. NCE-ists join in suppression of movement for Pigovian charges on polluters ("polluter pays" principle); replacement with the Coase Theorem. Nobel Laureates given to Coase and allied reactionaries: Becker, Stigler, Friedman, et al. (Nobel for Vickrey, but the citation never mentions his work on LVT; couples him with Mirrlees, a reactionary.)

Stigler, the true father and promoter of the "Coase Theorem," shows his continuing concern with discrediting George, by exhuming and publishing minutes of Oxford meeting where Marshall joined in heckling George, with Stigler adding snide remarks on George. (Marshall himself never published his comments.)

C. NCE-ists as "environmental economists" conspire to understate pollution damages by using "Willingness to Pay" (WTP) principle of valuing damages, instead of rival Willingness to Accept (WTA) principle - the WTA principle presumes that the victims, as the public, already own or "have the entitlement" to the environment. Vast literature purports to show that WTA is no higher than WTP, so data on WTP may be used as equal to WTA; evidence from surveys transparently doctored to support that position. Work by Mitchell and Carson, at Resources for the Future, Inc., subsidized by major polluters. Uphill battle of

Prof. Jack Knetsch (who left R.F.F., Inc.) to publish findings that WFA>>WTP.

D. J.B. Clark's view of the environment: it has no value until it is privatized. This view is now "The New Resource Economics."

E. Popularization by NCE-ists of the "Tragedy of the Commons," to rationalize ongoing enclosure movements applied to fisheries, airwaves, pollution easements, common air, et al. Hardin's eugenicist and fascist antecedents; his subsequent retraction of Tragedy of Commons; both pass unnoted by NCE-ists. Idea of privatization as a panacea is based on fallacy exploded by George in P&P and elsewhere, orig. called "free trade in land," which flopped in Ireland in 1860 (The Deasey Act).

14. George and urbanism

The sanitation/plumbing movement in growing U.S. cities, Progressive Era. The Garden City concept and movement. Contrast growth of cities in s.e. Asia and Latin America today, under influence of NCE advisors from IMF, World Bank, et al., choked with trash and pollution, "strapped for cash" (i.e. lacking local tax power - they certainly have a tax base).

George's support for city parks, and city "commons" of various kinds, like libraries and schools. His relationships with Ebenezer Howard, and the English planner of (Covent Garden? - help needed). Formation of Central Park (Frederick Law Olmsted), various noted landscape architects who planned or founded famous city parks (Daniel Burnham, Chicago). (Grady Clay, a good source?)

NCE denigration of city parks, for their open access; substitution of golf courses, private theme parks, etc. Downgrading city commons by making them places of last resort for the homeless.

H.G., Tom Johnson, and AFFORDABLE mass transit. Johnson's crusade for the 3 cent fare; New York's low transit fares. (Link to Hotelling, et al.) NCE responsibility for ruining mass transit by raising fares to lower property taxes. See Gottlieb book on how the Garden City concept was shriveled and shorn by NCE-ists after 1920.

NCE support for raising rates of private (and even public) utilities in order to hold down property taxes. NCE resistance to and rejection of marginal-cost pricing. NCE blindness to the social costs (negative externalities) of individualized big-rig trucks and motor cars.

In sum, George lined up with those who made cities work; NCE thinking denies the essentials of urbanism, turns from the garden city to the garden suburb and the horsey exurbs.

15. Concentration of wealth; progressivity of the property tax.

A. Intro.

H.G. focused on concentration of wealth. He stressed its political origins in giveaways of public land, but also its economic causes in the tendency of "free trade in land," absent a land tax, to lead to amassing of ownership of land. (He also stressed tech. economies of scale in agric.) "The great cause of the concentration of wealth is the concentration of landownership."

He saw taxation, and specifically land taxation, as the egalitarian remedy. This did not require a graduated rate structure, but was inherent in the nature of land as a tax base: concentrated in ownership, fixed in quantity, and often held in excess of the owner's needs.

B. Some of his early critics did not much question his analysis, but rather his value judgements: they accused him of such outrages and sacrileges as "Communism and confiscation under guise of law."

Many others, however, questioned his facts.

1. Pareto: distributions are always and everywhere the same.

2. Walker: distribution of farmland in the U.S. is equal, and growing moreso. (H.G.'s pioneering use of what is now called the Lorenz Curve, with no credit given to H.G.)

Cite my chapter on growing concentration of farmland. Reprint as much as space allows.

C. During and after The New Deal, however, with military service, and income taxation obviously confiscating wage and salary income at high rates, that old-fashioned attack lost its sting, and a new, subtler one was needed. NCE economists obliged, and have undercut George's case, by advancing, as orthodox learned doctrine, the claim that the property tax is "regressive." Astonishingly, they succeeded in establishing this implausible assertion, and now habitually repeat it, in a numbing drumbeat. They couple this with the easy assumption that the income tax is "progressive." They have exploited their control of economic discourse to implant and repeat this slogan, needing no analysis nor support, until journalists and public speakers now chant it reflexively.

(Here, insert an outline of how Musgrave et al. made the case; and how I refuted it in 1971. Include as much of "The Property Tax is a Progressive Tax" as space will permit.)

This writer put a finger in the dike against this tide in and after 1971. "TPTIAPT" was, judging from the demand, the support, and press coverage, the best-read article I ever published. NCE-ists were, however, equal to the occasion. They

produced a variant doctrine, modestly called "The New View," based on Harberger's premise that the supply of capital is fixed in a closed economy. This entails the amazing premises that 1, the proptax may be analyzed as a national tax (even though it isn't); 2) capital is not mobile among nations (even though it is); and 3) taxing capital in a closed economy does not discourage capital formation, nor encourage capital disinvestment, nor stimulate evasive actions by investors. NCE-ists complacently swallowed all that, as summarized in Aaron's book; and moved on. This all made capital just like land, and confused issues long enough to forestall any action until public attitudes entered a new phase.

Meantime, in California, control of politics moved into the control of those who disliked the proptax precisely because it IS progressive. Demeaning the property tax is the new, Politically Correct face of racism. (Cite new book, and other data, on low ratio of wealth to income among blacks.) Prop. 13 was largely supported on silent racist grounds, although of course it had to be subliminally, not openly. Income and sales taxes are taxes on upward mobility (blacks, browns, and yellows); property taxes, on past accumulations (whites). Howard Jarvis led them, and the rest is history. In the swirling of cross-currents and contradictions and hypocrisies that characterize political campaigns, however, it was perfectly all right to flay the tax one day for being regressive, and the next day for penalizing wealth. So today, as a few other states pare down their property taxes, and raise their sales and income taxes, confusion reigns in the reasons given for the change. Aging of the population is clearly one factor; resentment of draft-resistance by the young is another factor; degradation of public schools is a third.

D. New material on Who owns southern California? (done)

Current data on concentration of landownership, confirming H.G.'s forecast.

Contrast with Wolfe's chapter for LILP, in which he says land is LESS concentrated than other forms of wealth.

Contrast with the ruck of current Jeremiads about concentration, which talk about everything except land; which fail to distinguish wealth from income; etc.

Supplement with citations to current book on blacks' lack of wealth, relative to income.

16. Continuing Force and Fraud to create and perpetuate land tenures.

H.G.'s allegations, reinforced by Veblen and others.

NCE denies them.

A. Creates myth of the pioneer farmer mixing his labor into the land. Frank Knight, et al.

B. Creates myth and theory of nat. defense as a "public good" (the only example that NCE-ists still allow, they reject all the others, like the lighthouse example, etc.)

Demolish NCE view, using examples from old MS on "Benefits of Military Spending."

Four sources of net worth of U.S. corp. holdings abroad: capital flows, plowbacks, appropriations and appreciation, mostly subsidized and protected by U.S. armed forces, mostly exempt from taxes.

17. Tolley and others refute H.G.'s hypothesis that rising land prices may choke off production.

Tolley says the carpet of settlement may simply unroll another turn or two, giving access to new lands. Thus, land scarcity can always be overcome, and furthermore, in the process, it creates new investment opportunities, making jobs for labor and capital. (Link this with H.G. and Keynesianism, now Supplement #21 - might integrate them into one new chapter. Better yet, make it H.G. and macro-ecs., fuse it with cycle analysis.)

18. H.G. and dynamic ecs. and cycle analysis.

H.G. pioneered analysis of business cycle (although one may find earlier fragments, no doubt). J.B. Clark and Marshall both wore blinders on this topic, analyzing a static economy without major glitches, without quantum leaps of any kind.

Veblen's theory is eerily analogous to H.G.'s, but abstracted nearly to the vanishing point.

Veblen's student, Wesley Mitchell, is credited as major parent of cycle study - but he never analyzed, only gathered data.

Faced with H.G.'s theory, NCE-ists pick a few flaws and move right ahead. Quote some. Chicago then goes with Friedman's banking analysis, based on human failure. Austrians have their own banking analysis, blaming forced saving. Neither side notes how the collateral value of land leads banking expansion - except that when banks collapse, they are quick to blame the fall of land prices, and warn against taxing land to make them fall any more (case of Koichi Mera).

1. Use revised MS, in which I have already put many small changes.

2. Add to Cornell chapter. Leading role of Cornell's Western Union in helping Rutherford Hayes and the new Dixiecrats steal election of 1876; complaisance or complicity of Abram Hewitt, Tilden's campaign manager. (Link to Hewitt). Wheels within wheels.

3. Add to chap. on Alvin Johnson, a section on meaning of "rent."

Track down early definitions of taxable income, in classical economists, in which wages are not even considered income at all, but cost of maintaining bodies, and reproducing them, like capital. (Echoes of this in H.G.'s usage about driving down wages to the level at which labor will "consent to reproduce.") Original income tax was a tax on land income, and perhaps capital. (More research needed.)

Early subverters, like Nassau Senior, were already writing about rents for opera singers. Trace popularization of this revised definition of rent.

Expand discussion of rent, as suggested by Bramhall. (Among other things, note how those who say celebrity income is all rent, ignore the brain drain effect - the mobility of labor among taxing jurisdictions, as when great Swedish tennis players move to Monaco, etc.)

Quotes from new book on *Double Speak*, by Rutgers Professor / *Lutz*.

4. Add to corrupting agencies, the influence of Fed. grants and contracts and placements of personnel, on universities and writers. Agencies like tut-tut - well, you-know-what (YKW).

Frasu list. Control of thinktanks: Hoover Inst., CATO, Heritage Fdtn., LILP, Urban Inst., Brookings, and even some liberal and environmental orgs., e.g. the Env. Defense Fund, IPS (now pushing nat. sales tax).

Control of the Press, (which is the largest downtown landowner in many cities).

Control of radio and TV (which by their nature are major owners of a scarce natural resource).

Control of Prof. Assns: the NTA; TRED.

5. Worldwide reach of NCE, an American export of mind-control to Russia, S. Africa, Chile, et al. Its use by dominant internat. lenders. Attempts to impose uniform income tax rates world-wide. Privileged access of OECD economists to publication in the NTJ.

6. New, added examples of noted people who followed or paralleled H.G., e.g. Clarence Darrow, Emma Lazarus, Edward McGlynn, Samuel Seabury, Lawson Purdy, Perry Prentice, Jose Marti, more English socialists, Hong Kong, Kiaochow (Ludwig Schrameier), et al.

7. Harvard attacks discipline of geography, roots it out of schools. Economic geography weakened as a discipline, leaving control with members of the economics profession, teaching land economics, as per R.T. Ely.

8. Rabushka ignoring his own findings on HK, in his later "Bible" on the Flat Tax, with Robert Hall. Who at Hoover pushed him? (Or was it just "Blind Ambition"?)

9. Heroic stand of Louis F. Post against the Palmer Raids, 1920. Origins of J. Edgar Hoover as Chief of U.S. secret police, fighting the Georgist and civil-libertarian, Louis Post. Role of Columbia Law School Dean Harlan Stone in promoting Hoover.

10. Summary of fellow-travelling or cognate elements in Progressive movements, of which George and Georgists were parts.

- Feminism; votes for women

- Anti-child labor (Post, Nearing, et al.)

- Settlement House movement

- Conservation

- Civil liberties

- Public Schools

- Prof. Associations (Univ. Profs (John Dewey), promoting academic freedom; Nat. Tax Assn. (Lawson Purdy et al.); TRED; Intl. Assoc. of Assessing Officers;

 - Gradual subversion of those associations.

- The People's Lobby (Ben Marsh)

- Knights of Labor (Powderly)

- Anti-Poverty Society (McGlynn, precursor of liberation theology)

- Labor Statistics, and better Farm Census

- Housing

- Social Gospel Movement (a Rauschenbusch connection?)

- Regulation of natural monopolies, local and national

- Garden Cities

- Sanitation, public health (Wm. Gorgas, e.g.)

- Mass Transit

11. Labor unions, repd. by Post and Ralston, push for Labor Day - and select H.G.'s birthday. Were they hoping for a change of name?

12. New material on Ramsey and Pigou, and how their message pro LVT was too timidly stated, and totally buried. Pigou gets the J.S. Mill treatment: extinction by sneering. Blind acceptance by NCE paragons of "uniformity" as a tax norm.

New movements for nationwide uniformity of sales taxation (i.e. a nat. sales tax, as in Canada); and for worldwide tax "harmonization," leading toward world uniformity.

13. Failure of land tax leadership, post world war. Corruption of economics pulled rug out from under millennialism, leaving no field of activism except trivial localism, where the message could be simplified so no one could misunderstand it - or be scared by it.

Analogy: trivialization of the Garden City movement, documented in book by Gottlieb.

14. Progress of the doctrine of tax uniformity, to close off escape routes from taxes on mobile factors, make them resemble land. Seligman preached it early on (article in NTJ). Wisconsin applied it to income tax; Calif. to sales tax; etc. Now, OECD et al. would apply it internationally.

15. More new examples of academies pandering to wealth. (Some inside stuff collected from the Univ. of Calif.)

16. H.G. and electoral reforms (add to what is in 1st ed.). Georgists and the 19th Amendment (votes for women). Link with new chap on George and feminism.

17. The Institutionalist protest against NCE (Veblen, Commons, Ayres, their modern followers). Affinity of Institutionalists for George. Veblen's last book, Absentee Ownership, a paraphrase of H.G. on property in land.

Omission of community spirit, group spirit, social movements, etc., from NCE, with its methodology of sterile formalism proceeding from stilted premises about human action. NCE based on a priori premise of extreme individualism or "monadism." Quote H.G. about other springs of human action.

(E.g., NCE would never capture the idea of the textile mill rage in the old C.S.A., 1880-1940, as a social movement, with military and religious leadership, as observed by economist Broadus Mitchell, a George sympathizer.) (I have already done much work on Veblen and Commons.)

18. Add to chap. on Ely.

Persistence of false image of R.T. Ely as a "liberal," e.g. by J.K. Galbraith. Superficiality of perceptions by prominent wordsmiths.

New material on Allyn Young and R.T. Ely, from Sandilands.

19. More on case of Francis A. Walker.

A. New evidence (from Richard Sutch and Susan Carter) that Francis Walker doctored the 1880 Census returns (to understate child labor). No wonder he was so prickly when H.G. challenged his Census work.

B. Rose-colored views of Walker by the otherwise intelligent and fair-minded Prof. Whitaker of Charlottesville. Whitaker contrasts Walker and George, but leaves out the famous Census debate entirely! Frustration of trying to get responsive answers from confirmed academicians like Whitaker, Gaston, Bishko, or Mills, at Charlottesville: do they so value the quiet life?

C. Current data on farmland confirm George's forecasts of growing concentration. Rise of concentration is correlated with decline of land tax, both in time and among states. NCEist ag. economists ignore this completely, black it out. Why? Cf. "D".

D. Suppression of governmental agencies pushing for land reform, charging market prices for water, use of range, etc. Fate of the Bureau of Agric. Ecs. in the U.S.D.A., to punish it for publishing works of Walter Goldschmidt, Marion Clawson, Adon Poli, et al. Couple this with total dependence of research in Depts. of Agric. Ecs. on grants from the U.S.D.A.

20. The remarkable failure of black and immigrant Hispanic and Filipino voters to embrace Georgism, a cause obviously tailored to serve their interests. Why were early Irish immigrants so much more sensitive to the land question than are modern immigrants (and were Chinese immigrants contemporary with H.G.)? Scandinavian immigrants, too, have adopted George-like stances in the upper midwest, spilling north into the prairie provinces of Canada (often independently of overt Georgist influence). What is the problem with blacks, and Asians, and current immigrants? (Asians in Asia are highly receptive to Georgism.) (Selective immigration policy, admitting anti-Communist emigres from Viet Nam, Cuba, Korea, China, Iran, eastern Europe, etc. Reactionary role of Catholic Church, sharpened and honed after the McGlynn affair?)

21. Influence of H.G. on Keynesianism.

Early Keynesians use Turner thesis to rise to power, then drop it cold. Alvin Hansen made the closing of the frontier the

centerpiece of his Keynesian stagnation thesis, drawing on W.P. Webb, among others. Suddenly it disappeared, from ca. 1955, replaced by Hicks' "ISLM Curve" apparatus and Samuelson's "Neoclassical Synthesis."

Chicago NCEists promote concept of the endless frontier, denying natural scarcities entirely. Tolley; Julian Simon; Martin Bailey, with too much help from Barnett and Morse, Christy and Neal Potter at R.F.F., Inc. Their inevitable conflict with neo-Malthusians and environmentalists. Long period of sneering at them, e.g. at Toronto meetings, 1973.

Georgists and Keynesians slowly awaken to their mutual belief in raising investment opportunities by untaxing investing in new capital. Role of John R. Commons, early advocate of accelerated depreciation for new capital (not land). Brief honeymoon, ca. 1962-68, terminated by growth of Keynesian war-hawks, and election of R.M. Nixon.

22. New examples of economists' suspension of decorum in dealing with H.G. and like-minded persons. Personal insults; social ostracism (e.g. of Tom Johnson); name-calling and misrepresentation (agrarian, socialist, anarchist, open-access commonizer, city man, etc.).

23. New examples of bloodless inhumanity and frightfulness by economic writers: Malthus, Edgeworth, Pareto, Rector, Becker, Mirrlees, Gerald Uelmen, Senior, et al.

24. More on Ireland:

- a chapter by Edgeworth on "The Crisis in Ireland," with some chilling quotes
- quotes from Cecil Woodham-Smith on The Great Hunger, etc.
- mtrl from Pomfret, land qn in Ireland
- More on the sympathy and alliance of slaveholders of s.e. U.S. and the landlords of Ireland and England (noted in most histories of the C.S.A., e.g.).
- hints of a hypothesis that the Fenian Raids on Ontario were patronized by Radical Republican congressmen, either to achieve their ostensible end, or to embarrass Pres. Johnson, who had to send troops to stop them.

25. George's forecast of rising concentration of wealth. When the data showed a fall, NCE critics faulted H.G. Now the data show a rise, no mention of H.G.

26.